

P.2680 and P.3570), Hou (pp. 152-61: P.3432) and Eliasberg (p. 269: P.4976), in each case accompanied by a full French translation. The appearance of collections such as this one and the more recent (1982) Peking University volume *Tun-huang T'u-lu-fan wen-hsien yen-chiu lun-wen chi* 敦煌吐魯番文獻研究論文集, and also of series such as the *Kōza Tonkō* 講座敦煌 now being published in Tokyo, only serve to underline the richness of the collection now lying in the British Library, virtually untouched by current British scholarship. Let us hope, though, that Dr. Roderick Whitfield's magnificent three-volume series on the Stein Collection, *The art of Central Asia*, which will soon furnish a complete guide to Tun-huang art treasures in the British Museum, will stimulate further work on the manuscripts also.

T. H. BARRETT

KENNETH J. DEWOSKIN: *A song for one or two: music and the concept of art in early China*. (Michigan Papers in Chinese Studies, No. 42.) [xi], 202 pp. Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, University of Michigan, 1982. \$6.

*A song for one or two* is a book on the philosophical discussion of 'Music' in early China (until the fifth century A.D.) contrasted, where appropriate, with platonic ideas on music. Surprising, however, is the absence of reference to existing secondary material on the latter, an already well-studied subject, and also to the writings on music of later classical and late Roman philosophers. In his book, Dr. DeWoskin convincingly argues the important role of aural perception in China, a perception analogous in its importance to that of vision in Western tradition. Interrelationships between music, sound, and Chinese philosophical concepts (linked through the idea of *ch'i*—a term well explained, and then fortunately left untranslated) are shown in great detail on a carefully selected body of quotations from Chinese sources, given mainly in well-known translations by Western scholars but meticulously adjusted to the author's own terminology, and always with reference to the original Chinese text in a standard edition. The same praiseworthy accuracy and command of textual material is evident in the author's demonstration of continuity and change in attitude towards music in the period examined most thoroughly, namely, from the classical time until the end of the Six Dynasties.

This reviewer wondered, however, how much musicological thoroughness was applied to the middle part of the book. As soon as music as a performable and performed art is discussed, using Ming and Ch'ing sources for the zither *ch'in* as a point of departure, accuracy, so admirable in other sections, becomes rather doubtful: there are instances where a two-line standard definition and the use of the *terminus technicus* would have saved the author and reader a long-winded, and in parts even confusing, description of a phenomenon that is

after all simply a tablature; where 'inaudible sound' on the zither *ch'in* is in fact audible—albeit only to the performer, for whom this type of music is ultimately written (and not for a Western-style concert audience); and where plucked and bowed stringed instruments are introduced into this argument of 'inaudible sound', but for a period at which bowed instruments did not yet exist anywhere in the world. Against the author's assumption that 'inaudible sound' is unknown in Western music it has to be said that a *pianissimo* towards and including complete inaudibility is a well-known technique on bowed instruments in Western music.

The moment DeWoskin leaves the precarious field of musicology and musicianship, and argues *ch'in*-lore for a time at which no musical notation existed in China (before the end of the sixth century A.D.), the reviewer's admiration returns for a well concentrated presentation of the diverse philosophical, mythological, and psychological ideas on music for a most interesting period in the development of concepts and ideologies in China. Praise is also due to an enlightened publisher for the inclusion of footnotes at the bottom of the page, and for insertion of Chinese characters in the text. This reviewer is certainly looking forward to DeWoskin's next publication.

REMBRANDT F. WOLPERT

WILLIAM O. HENNESSEY (tr.): *Proclaiming harmony*. (Michigan Papers in Chinese Studies, No. 41.) xiv, 180 pp. Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, University of Michigan, 1981. \$6.

Best known in the history of Chinese fiction for containing a core episode of the *Shuihu* story, the late Song or Yuan narrative *Xuanhe yishi* makes an overdue appearance in the translation *Proclaiming harmony*. The original is of a curious mixture of classical and vernacular passages, and this the translator has attempted to present with a fair degree of success. The accuracy of the translation, however, leaves much to be desired. Important phrases and lines have been omitted (e.g. p. 7, l. 29; p. 18, l. 27; p. 31, l. 12, etc.) and at a conservative count, there are at least a hundred errors in translation. These include misreadings of names, poetic lines, dialogue, official documents, and narrative. In view of restrictions in space, I will only give a few examples from each category, with page references to some of the remainder.

Misreadings of names include Xian for Xuan (鉉 p. 8, l. 38); shi for zhi (志 p. 39, l. 6); Lu for Ke or Que (恪 p. 41, l. 37); ai for jie (碣 p. 53, l. 29); Jian for Qian (千 p. 54, l. 27); and Ling for Cen (岑 p. 54, l. 27). Others include, e.g., p. 4, l. 15, l. 17; p. 81, l. 33; p. 119, l. 27, etc.

Misreadings of poetic lines include the following:

*bu zhi ji ru gong qian jing, you zi ting chui yu shu hua*

Translated as:

'All unknowing, he entered the courtyard well.

Alone, he heard the strains of "Jade Tree Blossoms".' (p. 6, l. 7, l. 8)

Suggestion:

'He did not know that he was about to enter the courtyard well,

He was still listening to the strains of "Jade Tree Blossoms".'

*ya yi qiu xian mu wu huang*

Translated as:

'With honeyed words he sought immortals and venerated gods of war.' (p. 36, l. 1, l. 2)

Suggestion:

'With refined intent, he sought immortals and admired the Martial Emperor [Han Wudi]'

*yi zhao chong jiang ling*

Translated as:

'The morning he obeys a general's orders' (p. 55, l. 25)

Suggestion:

'The day he becomes a general'

*lu shan tan ban wu yan se*

Translated as:

'My chemise, made of stiff felt, is without color.' (p. 110, l. 12)

Suggestion:

'My tattered rags and sandalwood castanets, devoid of hue.'

*shi qu fang zhi hui jia gong*

Translated as:

'Not until it had already happened did they know enough to regret they were under attack.' (p. 120, l. 17, l. 18)

Suggestion:

'Not until the event was over did they know enough to regret their joint attack [of the Liao forces].'

*ke wu jia qi qi fei yan*

Translated as:

'The rising mist bodes nothing good, for sure!' (p. 128, l. 21)

Suggestion:

'Is there no auspicious air that will lift the smouldering fires of conflict?'

Other misreadings include, e.g., p. 5, l. 23; p. 8, l. 1, l. 2; p. 25, l. 17, l. 18; p. 43, lines 14-17, etc.

Misreadings of dialogue include the following:

*dang wei ban yi shi, gu ji gui*

Translated as: 'Stick around for a while and I'll do you a favor.' (p. 33, l. 23)

Suggestion: 'I will do you a favour. For the time being hasten back.'

*qi you lang she tian zi tuo kong fo*

Translated as: 'Do you think that I, Son of Heaven, could be untrustworthy, like a loose tongue in a hollow Buddha?' (p. 68, l. 7, l. 8)

Suggestion: 'Can there be a Son of Heaven who speaks with a loose tongue, or a Buddha who tells lies?'

*Zan shou ming xuan fu, fei shou tu chen ye. Da shuai ruo yu ci qi ze, ze chao ting zhi shuai yu he wei zai.*

Translated as: 'My orders were to pacify this region—not to defend some local official. If you choose to relinquish your position, what can the court do about it?' (p. 104, lines 25-27)

Suggestion: 'My orders were to pacify this region, not to defend it. If you choose to relinquish your responsibility, then to what purpose did the court appoint you?'

*Mian zhi, mian zhi.*

Translated as: 'Stay away if you can.' (p. 133, l. 14)

Suggestion: 'Take courage.'

*Yi dan huo qi, wu hui he ji.*

Translated as: 'Some day I may do something we shall regret.' (p. 144, l. 32)

Suggestion: 'The day trouble erupts, it will be too late for me to be sorry.'

*Ci shui dun qing jing.*

Translated as: 'This water is still undefiled.' (p. 152, l. 35)

Suggestion: 'This water will immediately turn pure [again].'

Other misreadings include, e.g., p. 24, ll. 6-8; p. 42, ll. 7-8; p. 44, ll. 24-26; p. 49, ll. 7-9; p. 58, ll. 26-27; p. 59, l. 23; p. 85, l. 34; p. 113, ll. 1-4, etc.

Misreadings of documents include:

*Zhu fu shang shou qing chou er ken cong, zhi zi qian yi wan liu er bu que.*

Translated as: 'They offered wishes for long life for the emperor and his consort. They asked for favors, following you around. The youngsters tugged at your robes to keep you from leaving.' (p. 45, ll. 17-19)

Suggestion: 'When the mistress of the house toasted your long life and begged for a reward, you were willing to comply. When the youngsters tugged at your robes to keep you from leaving, you did not refuse.'

*Mei si yi ta zhi wai, qi rong ta ren han shui.*

Translated as: 'Every time he thought of leaving his bed, did he let others sleep?' (p. 74, l. 40)

Suggestion: 'Every time he thought [of the saying], "Next to one's bed, can one allow others to snore?"'

*Jin ye jian ruo gong mei,*

Translated as: 'In more recent times, a coalition of weaker forces could have overcome the stronger.' (p. 96, l. 20)

Suggestion: 'In the present situation, by annexing the weak and attacking the befuddled,'

*Jin ri zhi shi, jiu jiang shei zhi.*

Translated as: 'Who can now undo the damage he has done?' (p. 107, l. 34)

Suggestion: 'As for the present state of affairs, who is to bear the responsibility?'

Other misreadings include p. 10, ll. 25-26; p. 42, l. 32; p. 102, l. 5; p. 105, ll. 15-16; p. 171, ll. 36, 40, 41, 44, 45, 48.

Finally, misreadings of the narrative include:

*Ren chu zai qi zhong zhe, zhe jie jue nie, shang ren shen zhong.*

Translated as: 'Farm animals which came in contact with the mist all became rabid and harmed their owners.' (p. 21, ll. 10-12)

Suggestion: 'It would inevitably bite people or animals who were in the mist, and it harmed quite a number of people.'

*Wen xuan wang miao*

Translated as: 'temple of Emperor Ying-zong' (p. 28, l. 5)

Suggestion: 'temple of Confucius'

*xiang yuan*

Translated as: 'Incense rings' (p. 43, l. 19)

Suggestion: 'Lemons'

*Shi Fang La jia you qi yuan.*

Translated as: 'At that time Fang La was living in Qiyuan,' (p. 48, l. 5)

Suggestion: 'At that time Fang La's family owned a plantation of lacquer trees.'

Page 79, line 5. Confucius should be Mencius.

*wu zhang ba fang*

Translated as: 'a mist eight stories tall' (p. 86, l. 28)

Suggestion: 'a mist spread in all directions'

*qi bao shu zhu*

Translated as: 'some gems and pearls' (p. 89, l. 3)

Suggestion: 'prayer beads made from the seven precious materials'

*zhong gui ren*

Translated as: 'a Chinese of the noble class' (p. 146, l. 33)

Suggestion: 'a eunuch'

*yi shao you ci jiu bo zhi wang yi.*

Translated as: 'he had the prospect of more wine and finer clothes.' (p. 159, l. 33)

Suggestion: 'he had few prospects of gifts of wine and silk.'

Other misreadings include, e.g. p. 6, l. 23; p. 16, l. 24; p. 21, ll. 4-5; p. 21, l. 29; p. 22, ll. 18-19; p. 22, l. 30; p. 26, l. 14, etc.

In summary, this translation needs an overall revision. More annotation would also be desirable.

ANDREW LO

DOUGLAS LANCASHIRE (ed. and tr.):

*Chinese essays on religion and faith.*

(Asian Library Series, No. 26.) xi,

293 pp. San Francisco: Chinese Materials Center, 1981. \$20.50.

Little is published in the West about the existential soul-searchings of twentieth-century China. Too often it is assumed that all has been doctrinal allegiance and strife for the practicalities of power. It must be hoped that these latter have profound questionings behind them, and this collection of translations of 15 twentieth-century articles from the Chinese confirm that such has sometimes been the case. The authors of the articles include some who

have figured gigantically in the intellectual foment and history of China this century, notably Ts'ai Yüan-p'ei, Hu Shih and Ch'en Tu-hsiu, making it all the more surprising that here in most cases is the first time that these vital views of such men have been made available to the non-sinological Westerner.

The selection of articles is broad and balanced. Some were written in response to others here translated, as part of momentous written debates, and their inclusion adds the further excitement of direct combat, the thrust and parry of opposing and fervently held viewpoints, to the book. There is advocacy of Christianity, Confucianism, Buddhism and atheism, and attempts to refute these beliefs. There are also recommendations of less commonly promoted attitudes to life.

Ts'ai Yüan-p'ei urges 'aesthetics as a substitute for religion', in the manner perhaps of Keats's 'Beauty is truth, truth beauty', but with more detailed elucidations of the beneficial effects of such a creed on human behaviour. He sees value in both tragedy and humour, in the literary beauty that they afford the mind. His respect for humour, so often a shallowly underrated commodity, follows a strong Chinese tradition going back at least as far as pronouncements by Confucius and Ssu-ma Ch'ien, but states the case with fresh boldness and succinctness. He concludes:

'All that which pertains to great tragedy and elegant humour is sufficient to destroy man's egotism, and to do away with his pre-occupation with advantages and disadvantages, gains and losses. It nurtures the intelligence, causing it to progress to even greater heights, and is completely satisfying.' He seems to see the belief in, or pursuit of, aesthetics as a means of quietening and rationalizing human emotions, as opposed to the religions, which 'all serve to inflame the emotions'. Arguing in words that sometimes echo age-old Buddhist and Taoist attitudes, he declares:

'The reason why pure aesthetics can refine man's emotions is because it causes man to possess the highest and purest of habits, and brings about a gradual diminution of those prejudices which distinguish the self from others and which seek to benefit the self at the expense of others. If beauty is regarded as universal, absolutely no view of the difference between oneself and others can intrude into it.'

Hu Shih takes 'immortality' as his religion. His is a subtle and elaborate definition of immortality, which sees every individual as a pebble rippling the pool of posterity incalculably:

'To sum up, this theory of immortality asserts that the merits and sins, words and actions (whether great or small, good or bad) of every individual leave behind them a certain influence in the "great self", and every one of them is eternally immortal along with the eternally imperishable "great self".'

Hu is at pains to distinguish this concept from the more élitist and exclusive Confucian concepts of an immortality that is embodied in posterity: