

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

McCUTCHEEN, DOYLE, BROWN & ENERSEN
Thomas J. Rosch
Robert L. Ebe
Daniel M. Wall
Three Embarcadero Center
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 393-2000

NEUMAN, WILLIAMS, ANDERSON & OLSON
Theodore W. Anderson
James T. Williams
77 West Washington Street
Chicago, IL 60602
Telephone: (312) 346-1200

Attorneys for Plaintiffs
The Magnavox Company and
Sanders Associates, Inc.

United States District Court For The
Northern District Of California

THE MAGNAVOX COMPANY, a corporation,)
and SANDERS ASSOCIATES, INC.,)
a corporation,)
Plaintiffs,)
v.)
ACTIVISION, INC., a corporation,)
Defendant.)

No. C 82 5270 JPV
PLAINTIFFS' STATEMENT
OF FACTUAL ISSUES

1. This case is an action for infringement of United States Letters Patent Re. 28,507 (hereinafter "the '507 patent").

PLAINTIFFS' STATEMENT OF FACTUAL ISSUES

1
2 2. The '507 patent is a reissue patent. It was
3 originally issued on April 25, 1972 as United States patent
4 3,659,284 entitled "Television Gaming Apparatus" to the plaintiff
5 Sanders Associates, Inc., as assignee of the named inventor
6 William T. Rusch from application Serial No. 828,154 filed on May
7 27, 1969. The application for reissue, Serial No. 464,256, was
8 filed on April 25, 1974. The '507 patent, upon reissue, has the
9 same effect as if it had been originally granted on April 25, 1972
10 in its amended reissue form.

11 3. The '507 patent relates in general to apparatus for
12 playing games on television receivers.

13 4. The plaintiffs in this action are The Magnavox
14 Company (hereinafter "Magnavox") and Sanders Associates, Inc.,
15 (hereinafter "Sanders"). At all times relevant here Sanders is
16 and has been a corporation of the state of Delaware and the owner
17 of the '507 patent and corresponding patents in foreign countries.
18 At all times relevant here Magnavox is and has been a corporation
19 of the state of Delaware and the exclusive licensee of Sanders
20 under the '507 patent and the corresponding patents in foreign
21 countries.

22 5. This is the third action for infringement of the
23 '507 patent to be litigated and decided. The opinions in the two
24 previously decided actions are The Magnavox Co. v. Chicago Dynamic
25 Industries, 201 U.S.P.Q. 25 (N.D. Ill. 1977) and The Magnavox Co.
26 v. Mattel, Inc., 216 U.S.P.Q. 28 (N.D. Ill. 1982). There have
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
10. At the trial of the Mattel case, Judge Leighton received factual and expert testimony offered by the parties on the issue of infringement of the '507 patent as well as memoranda of the parties on the issues. The testimony was both live, trial testimony and by deposition.

7
8
9
10
11
12
11. At the conclusion of the trial of the Mattel case, Judge Leighton entered an opinion, findings of fact, conclusions of law, and judgment holding the '507 patent to be enforceable and to have been infringed by all of the games accused in that action. Judge Leighton found that the subject matter of that patent was neither shown nor suggested by the prior art.

13
14
12. The defendant Activision, Inc., (hereinafter "Activision") is a corporation of the state of California.

15
16
13. Activision is in the business of designing, manufacturing, and selling television game cartridges.

17
18
19
20
14. A television game cartridge is a device which is used in combination with a television game console to permit the playing of a television game. The nature and play of the game is defined by the configuration of and information contained in the television game cartridge.

21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
15. Activision has manufactured and sold in the United States the television game cartridges known by the titles Tennis, Ice Hockey, Boxing, Fishing Derby, Stampede, Pressure Cooker, Dolphin, Grand Prix, Barnstorming, Sky Jinks, Enduro, Keystone Kapers, and Decathlon, among others.

1
2 16. Plaintiffs allege that the manufacture, use, and/or
3 sale of the combination of any one of the Activision television
4 game cartridges listed in the following table and a television
5 game console capable of using that cartridge constitutes an act of
6 infringement of the stated claims of the '507 patent, and
7 plaintiffs further allege that the sale of any one of said
8 cartridges listed in the following table constitutes an act of
9 contributory infringement of, and inducement to infringe, the
10 stated claims of that same patent:

<u>Cartridge Title</u>	<u>Claims</u>
Tennis	25,26,51,52,60,61,62
Ice Hockey	25,26,51,52,60,61,62
Boxing	25,26,51,52,60
Fishing Derby	25,26,51,52,60,61
Stampede	25,51,60
Pressure Cooker	25,26,51,52,60
Dolphin	25,51,60
Grand Prix	60
Barnstorming	60
Sky Jinks	60
Enduro	60
Keystone Kapers	60
Decathlon	60

1 screen. Each human player manipulated his corresponding player
2 symbol to intercept the path of the ball as it moved across the
3 screen. When the player symbol intercepted the ball symbol, i.e.,
4 two symbols appeared to be coincident on the screen, the motion of
5 the ball was changed.

6 22. In the television game apparatus operated in
7 January, 1968, and embodying some of Rusch's work, upon
8 interception the horizontal motion of the ball was reversed so
9 that it traveled back toward the other player. Each player had an
10 "English" control which permitted him to alter the vertical motion
11 of the ball after he had intercepted it.

12 23. Apparatus such as described in paragraphs 21 and 22
13 hereof is described in the '507 patent.

14 24. From 1968 through 1971, Sanders demonstrated under
15 agreements of confidence television game apparatus using various
16 pieces of equipment and playing various games to parties it
17 thought might be interested in entering into some type of
18 arrangement to further develop and commercialize the work it had
19 done. Demonstrations of that work were made to representatives of
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 Teleprompter Corporation, RCA Corporation, Zenith Radio
2 Corporation, General Electric Company, Motorola, Inc., Warwick
3 Electronics, Inc., The Magnavox Company, and others.

4 25. In March, 1971, Sanders and Magnavox entered into
5 an agreement under which Magnavox received an option for an
6 exclusive license under the pending United States patent
7 application which eventually resulted in the '507 patent, other
8 Sanders United States patent applications relating to television
9 games, and corresponding applications in foreign countries.

10 26. Magnavox made a limited number of television games
11 and market tested them at a few locations around the country
12 following the March, 1971 agreement. After these market tests,
13 Magnavox commercially introduced the product.

14 27. By an agreement effective January 27, 1972,
15 Magnavox exercised its option and became the exclusive licensee of
16 Sanders under the United States patent application which
17 eventually resulted in the '507 patent, other Sanders United
18 States patent applications relating to television games,
19 corresponding applications in foreign countries, and the patents
20 to issue therefrom.

21 28. Since entering into the exclusive license agreement
22 referred to in paragraph 27 hereof, Magnavox has manufactured and
23 sold television games in the United States under the trademark
24 "ODYSSEY." The ODYSSEY television games are intended for use by
25 consumers with their home television receivers.

1 29. The first model ODYSSEY television game
2 commercially introduced by Magnavox was the Model 1TL 200; the
3 Model 1TL 200 ODYSSEY television game was first placed on sale by
4 Magnavox in the Spring of 1972.

5 30. In the 1972 Magnavox ODYSSEY television game, the
6 display shown on the television picture tube screen included a
7 white rectangular symbol on the right side of the screen
8 representing a first player, a white rectangular symbol on the
9 left side of the screen representing a second player, and a symbol
10 which moved across the screen representing a playing piece such as
11 a ball, which for convenience will be called the "ball symbol".
12 Player controls were provided so that each human player could move
13 his corresponding player symbol on the face of the television
14 screen both horizontally and vertically. Each human player
15 manipulated his corresponding player symbol to intercept the path
16 of the ball as it moved across the screen. When the player symbol
17 intercepted the ball symbol, i.e., two symbols appeared to be
18 coincident on the screen, the motion of the ball was changed and,
19 in particular, the horizontal motion of the ball was reversed so
20 that it traveled back toward the other player. Each player had an
21 "English" control which permitted him to alter the vertical motion
22 of the ball after he had intercepted it.

23 31. The 1972 Magnavox ODYSSEY television game could be
24 made to play one of several different games by inserting a game
25 card for the particular game selected into the game unit. Thus,
26 it was a programmable game.

1
2 38. Prior to August 21, 1969, Bushnell had no knowledge
3 of the existence of any apparatus using a cathode ray tube display
4 for simulating the playing of the game table tennis or ping pong.

5 39. On May 24, 1972, while employed by Nutting
6 Associates, Inc., Mountain View, California, Bushnell attended the
7 demonstration of the Magnavox ODYSSEY television game in
8 Burlingame, California, and saw a demonstration of the game.
9 Bushnell went to that show for the specific purpose of seeing the
10 Magnavox ODYSSEY television game.

11 40. At the May 24, 1972 show, Bushnell saw the ODYSSEY
12 television game in use to play a game simulating ping pong and
13 actually played that game.

14 41. During the Summer of 1972 Atari was formed and some
15 time after June 26, 1972, Allen Alcorn became an employee of Atari
16 and Bushnell gave Alcorn the assignment of developing a video game
17 which would simulate a tennis game.

18 42. The arcade video game Pong resulted from the
19 efforts at Atari and was first manufactured and sold by Atari in
20 1973.

21 43. In the Pong television game, the display shown on
22 the picture tube screen included a white rectangular symbol on the
23 right side of the screen representing a first player, a white
24 rectangular symbol on the left side of the screen representing a
25 second player, and a symbol which moved across the screen repre-
26 senting a ball. Player controls were provided so that each human
27 player could move his corresponding player symbol on the face of
28

1
2 48. In 1975, Magnavox commercially introduced the
3 ODYSSEY 100 and ODYSSEY 200 home television games, the Models
4 YF7010 and 7015, respectively.

5 49. In 1976, General Instrument Corporation, New York,
6 New York (hereinafter "General Instrument") commercially
7 introduced an electronic integrated circuit component which
8 included in a single integrated circuit device the great majority
9 of electrical components previously needed to manufacture a
10 television game. That integrated circuit component was designated
11 by General Instrument as the AY-3-8500 component.

12 50. The presence on the market of the General
13 Instrument AY-3-8500 integrated circuit component permitted the
14 manufacture of television games with many fewer components, and,
15 thus, at a much lower cost, than was previously possible.

16 51. The General Instrument AY-3-8500 integrated circuit
17 component included within it a read only memory. The read only
18 memory was used in part to define the size and shape of the
19 symbols which were displayed on the television screen. A read
20 only memory is generally referred to as a ROM.

21 52. The television games which could be constructed
22 using the General Instrument AY-3-8500 integrated circuit
23 component were capable of playing multiple ball and paddle games.

24 53. In 1976, Magnavox commercially introduced the
25 ODYSSEY 300, ODYSSEY 400, ODYSSEY 500, and ODYSSEY 3000 television
26 games, the Models BG 7500, BG 7516, BG 7520, BH 7514,
27
28

1 respectively, and the Model BG 4305, a television receiver having
2 a built-in television game. Each were capable of playing multiple
3 ball and paddle games.

4 54. In 1977, Magnavox commercially introduced the
5 ODYSSEY 2000 and ODYSSEY 4000 television games, the Models BG 7510
6 and BH 7511, respectively. Each were capable of playing multiple
7 ball and paddle games.

8 55. The Magnavox ODYSSEY 300, ODYSSEY 2000, ODYSSEY
9 3000, and ODYSSEY 4000 television games utilized the General
10 Instrument AY-3-8500 component. The Magnavox ODYSSEY 300 is a
11 typical one of the games using that component.

12 56. Prior to the commercial introduction of television
13 games including microprocessors, most of the television games sold
14 for use in the home were of the type known as "ball and paddle"
15 games. The 1972 ODYSSEY, ODYSSEY 100, ODYSSEY 200, ODYSSEY 300,
16 ODYSSEY 400, ODYSSEY 500, ODYSSEY 2000, ODYSSEY 3000, ODYSSEY
17 4000, and Atari's consumer Pong television games are examples of
18 such games.

19 57. Ball and paddle television games formed the basis
20 for the establishment of the home television game industry and
21 this occurred prior to the commercial introduction of home
22 television games incorporating microprocessors.

23 58. Commencing in 1977, various manufacturers
24 commercially introduced television games which included
25 microprocessors. Those manufacturers included Atari, Fairchild,
26 and Bally.

1
2 59. The use of a microprocessor in conjunction with
3 plug-in ROM cartridges in a television game permitted construction
4 of a television game console which could be readily made to play a
5 wider variety of television games. Cartridges are provided which
6 can be plugged into the television game console and thereby
7 connected to the circuitry within the console. Different
8 cartridges are provided for different games. Each cartridge
9 contains a ROM.

10 60. The ROM included within a television game cartridge
11 includes a particular configuration and information used by the
12 circuitry of the television game console to define the game to be
13 played when that cartridge is plugged into the console. The
14 cartridge manufacturer defines the game to be played when using a
15 particular cartridge by the configuration and information placed
16 into the ROM used in that cartridge when the cartridge is
17 manufactured.

18 61. The consumer user of a television game console is
19 unable to alter the configuration of or the information stored in
20 the read only memory of the game cartridge and thus is unable to
21 alter the definition of the game which is played when that
22 cartridge is placed in use.

23 62. Atari was a party in the Chicago Dynamic Industries
24 action which came to trial in 1976 and 1977 and has taken a
25 license under the '507 patent.
26
27
28

1
2 63. Bally and Fairchild were defendants in the Mattel
3 action but settled out prior to trial. Fairchild took a license
4 under the '507 patent. Bally, having stopped manufacturing and/or
5 selling the television games which formed the basis for the charge
6 of infringement of the '507 patent, settled for its past
7 infringements and took an option for a license under the '507
8 patent if it should resume those activities. Judgments on consent
9 of the parties thereto were entered as to both Fairchild and Bally
10 that television games that they manufactured and that included a
11 microprocessor infringed the '507 patent, and that the patent was
12 valid.

13 64. In 1978, Magnavox commercially introduced the
14 ODYSSEY² television game which included a microprocessor.

15 65. The 13 Activision television game cartridges
16 alleged to be covered by the '507 patent have no substantial use
17 other than to be combined with a television game console and a
18 television receiver to play the television game for which that
19 cartridge is programmed and configured. Activision knew this
20 throughout the period it designed, used, manufactured, and/or sold
21 each of such television game cartridges.

22 66. Each of the 13 Activision television game
23 cartridges alleged to be covered by the '507 patent is especially
24 made and configured and especially adapted by Activision to be
25 combined with a television game console and a television receiver
26 to play the television game for which that cartridge is programmed
27
28

1 and configured. Activision knew this throughout the period it
2 designed, used, manufactured, and/or sold each of such television
3 game cartridges.

4 67. None of the 13 Activision television game
5 cartridges alleged to be covered by the '507 patent is a staple
6 article or commodity of commerce. Activision knew this throughout
7 the period it designed, used, manufactured, and/or sold each of
8 such television game cartridges.

9 68. Activision has used each of the 13 Activision
10 television game cartridges alleged to be covered by the '507
11 patent in combination with a television game console and a
12 television receiver to play the game programmed into that
13 cartridge within the United States.

14 69. Activision has demonstrated each of the 13
15 Activision television game cartridges alleged to be covered by the
16 '507 patent in combination with a television game console and a
17 television receiver to prospective customers within the United
18 States.

19 70. Activision has demonstrated and shown each of the
20 13 Activision television game cartridges alleged to be covered by
21 the '507 patent both in combination with a television game console
22 and a television receiver to prospective customers at Consumer
23 Electronic Shows held in Las Vegas, Nevada and Chicago, Illinois.

24 71. In each of the Activision television games Tennis,
25 Ice Hockey, Boxing, Fishing Derby, Stampede, Pressure Cooker and
26 Dolphin, a human player manipulates a symbol on the television
27